



Medicines & Healthcare products
Regulatory Agency



NIBSC
Confidence in Biological Medicines

WHO/BS/2018.2335

WHO 7th International Standard for Rabies Vaccine

Dianna E. Wilkinson, Jason Hockley, Peter Rigsby and the
Collaborative Study Group





**World Health
Organization**

**Post-ECBS WHO/BS/2018.2335
ENGLISH ONLY**

EXPERT COMMITTEE ON BIOLOGICAL STANDARDIZATION

Geneva, 29 October to 2 November 2018

**International collaborative study to assess the suitability of the candidate
7th WHO International Standard for rabies vaccine**

**Dianna E. Wilkinson^{1#}, Jason Hockley², Peter Rigsby² and the Collaborative Study
Group***

*¹Division of Virology and ²Biostatistics,
National Institute for Biological Standards and Control,
South Mimms, Potters Bar, Herts, EN6 3QG, UK*

Introduction

- Rabies vaccines for human use are produced in many countries and the **minimum potency requirements are expressed in IU.**
- The WHO International Standard for rabies vaccine (inactivated) is used by manufacturers of human and veterinary vaccines and control testing laboratories for the standardisation of:
 - **NIH mouse potency tests**
 - **ELISA and Single Radial Immunodiffusion (SRD) assays for glycoprotein content**
- **The current IS (6th IS NIBSC code 07/162 is essentially depleted**
- A collaborative study was undertaken to assess the suitability of a candidate **7th IS (NIBSC code 16/204)**, which was **prepared from a purified and inactivated bulk of Vero cell-derived, Pitman Moore strain, rabies vaccine**, and to calibrate it in International Units (IU).

Collaborative study samples

Sample ID	Sample Description	Sample volume filled per tube (mL)	Presentation	Assigned or target potency
07/162	6th IS for Rabies Vaccine	0.5	Freeze-dried	8 IU/ml in 1 mL (NIH) 6.6 IU/ml in 0.5 mL (ELISA and SRD)
RAV	5th IS for Rabies Vaccine	1.0	Freeze-dried	16 IU/mL in 1 mL (NIH test)
Sample A	Candidate 7 th IS (NIBSC 16/204)	0.5	Freeze-dried	Target formulation potency based on vaccine bulk antigen content. 7 IU/mL by SRD
Sample B	Candidate 7 th IS (NIBSC 16/204)	0.5	Freeze-dried	
Sample C	Bulk preparation remaining from 6 th IS production	1.0	Liquid	Not determined (in vitro assays)

Candidate 7th Rabies Vaccine IS production

The bulk vaccine provided to NIBSC for formulating the candidate 7th IS was produced by the same manufacturing process used to prepare the bulk that went into the formulation of the 6th IS.

- Pitman Moore strain
- Vero cell-derived
- Purified inactivated bulk

NIBSC code	16/204
Product name	7th IS Rabies Vaccine
Collaborative study code	CS605
Filling machine	Bausch & Strobel AFV5090
Date of filling	22 September 2016
No. of ampoules filled	11,098
Mean fill weight (g)	0.5238
CV of fill weight (%)	0.3255 n=372
Freeze dryer	CS100
Date of completion of lyophilization	27 September 2016
Mean dry weight (g)	0.0551
CV of dry weight (%)	0.3478 n=6
Mean residual moisture (%)	0.4
CV of residual moisture (%)	20.5 n=12
Mean oxygen content (%)	0.13
CV of oxygen content (%)	81.37 n=12
No. of ampoules available to WHO as of March 2018	10,298

16/204 was validated in NIH, ELISA (Ref lab 1) and SRD (Ref lab 2) before use in the collaborative study

Collaborative study design

Participants were requested to:

- perform 3 independent assays
- use a freshly opened vial or reconstituted ampoule for each assay.
- reconstitute the freeze-dried samples as directed in the instructions for use.
 - NIH assay: 1mL
 - ELISA and SRD: 0.5mL
- prepare and test a series of dilutions for the 6th IS and each study sample and **test all samples concurrently**
- Report results using the Excel worksheet supplied by NIBSC

Collaborative study design

Statistical Analysis:

- Data were analysed using the EDQM software CombiStats
 - **NIH mouse potency** test: **probit bioassay** analysis comparing transformed assay responses to log dose using the **6th IS (8 IU/mL)** when reconstituted as directed in 1 mL water)
 - **ELISA: parallel line or sigmoid curve model** with untransformed or log transformed responses. Potencies were expressed relative to the **6th IS (6.6 IU/ml)** when reconstituted as directed in 0.5 ml water i.e. 3.3 IU/ampoule)
 - **SRD assays: slope-ratio assays**. Potencies were expressed relative to the **6th IS (6.6 IU/ml)** when reconstituted as directed in 0.5 ml water i.e. 3.3 IU/ampoule)

Collaborative study results

- 16 laboratories from 12 countries returned data sets for 26 assays. Argentina (2), Canada (1), France (2), Germany (2), India (2), Mexico (1) Russian Federation (1), Serbia (1), South Africa (1), Thailand (1) UK (1) and USA (1)
- Labs were randomly assigned codes

Laboratory code	Method
1	SRD
2	NIH
3a	NIH
3b	ELISA
3c	SRD
4	ELISA
5a	NIH
5b	ABT
6a	NIH
6b1	ELISA technician 1
6b2	ELISA technician 2
7a	NIH
7b	ELISA
7c	SRD

Laboratory code	Method
8	SRD
9a	ELISA
9b	NIH
10	NIH
11	NIH
12a	ELISA
12b	NIH
13a	SRD
13b	SRD
14	NIH
15	ELISA
16	ELISA

Data sets

10 NIH test

9 ELISA

6 SRD

1 ABT laboratory calculated and provided results for their in vitro ABT method.

ABT: Antibody binding test. This method tests the antigen content of a vaccine after neutralization with a standard antibody in competition with rabies strain CVS-11

NIH Test Results – Sample A (16/204)

Lab Code	Assay	LCL	Potency (IU/mL)	UCL	Intra-laboratory %GCV	LCL	Laboratory GM Potency (IU/mL)	UCL
2	1	~	NP	~				
2	2	7.665	19.865	55.043	n/a	3.976	7.595	14.508
2	3	1.530	3.665	8.514				
3a	1	2.539	6.307	15.454				
3a	2	0.750	2.261	6.026	102%	3.424	5.696	9.475
3a	3	4.146	8.704	19.113				
5a	1	3.146	8.982	25.980				
5a	2	1.998	5.262	13.412	32%	3.703	6.416	11.117
5a	3	2.500	6.022	14.359				
6a	1	7.416	26.306	114.504				
6a	2	6.757	20.125	67.315	46%	8.965	17.448	33.958
6a	3	4.556	12.426	34.924				
7a	1	3.835	7.359	13.956				
7a	2	4.546	7.974	13.932	8%	5.624	7.978	11.317
7a	3	4.644	8.600	16.076				
9b	1	1.688	7.523	33.242				
9b	2	2.400	9.582	40.120	18%	3.518	7.919	17.827
9b	3	1.819	6.958	26.087				
10	1	~	NP	~				
10	2	3.536	13.167	46.724	n/a	3.972	11.358	32.482
10	3	1.241	8.494	46.310				
11	1	3.089	9.306	28.454				
11	2	3.558	8.373	19.759	29%	4.357	7.532	13.020
11	3	2.153	5.746	13.723				
12b	1	2.850	7.123	17.452				
12b	2	2.047	5.401	13.271	15%	3.580	6.149	10.562
12b	3	2.189	5.976	15.344				
14	1	7.302	16.330	37.638				
14	2	7.799	17.448	40.095	5%	11.005	17.353	27.361
14	3	8.727	18.144	38.086				

Sample A	
Laboratory GM Potency	
Min	5.696
Max	17.448
Intra-laboratory %GCV	
Min	5%
Max	102%

Sample A	
Overall GM (IU/mL)	8.803
95% CL	6.587-11.764
Overall %GCV	50%

NIH Test Results – Sample B (16/204)

Lab Code	Assay	LCL	Potency (IU/mL)	UCL	Intra-laboratory %GCV	LCL	Laboratory GM Potency (IU/mL)	UCL
2	1	7.848	15.479	30.681				
2	2	6.434	16.923	47.894	11%	10.678	16.905	26.762
2	3	8.754	19.028	42.678				
3a	1	2.911	7.844	21.101				
3a	2	1.944	5.243	13.663	46%	4.952	8.265	13.796
3a	3	5.271	11.224	24.021				
5a	1	3.112	7.866	19.858				
5a	2	2.629	6.592	16.311	35%	3.593	6.163	10.571
5a	3	1.626	4.380	11.248				
6a	1	3.847	12.952	46.895				
6a	2	4.817	16.429	64.671	25%	6.412	12.658	24.990
6a	3	3.777	10.549	30.091				
7a	1	~	NL	~				
7a	2	4.079	7.042	11.991	n/a	4.511	6.759	10.128
7a	3	3.439	6.412	11.680				
9b	1	2.994	14.20	83.24				
9b	2	0.783	3.82	15.11	103%	2.510	5.833	13.554
9b	3	1.203	4.69	16.31				
10	1	1.257	5.323	19.064				
10	2	0.906	4.093	14.708	27%	2.389	5.264	11.596
10	3	1.585	6.597	23.670				
11	1	6.885	18.284	52.102				
11	2	2.530	6.838	18.238	67%	5.758	10.272	18.324
11	3	3.240	8.854	24.352				
12b	1	3.514	8.068	18.547				
12b	2	2.752	6.422	14.512	35%	3.891	6.681	11.471
12b	3	0.988	4.448	15.436				
14	1	8.122	17.158	36.904				
14	2	7.592	17.053	39.584	3%	11.199	17.474	27.267
14	3	8.709	18.130	38.069				

Blinded Duplicate

Sample B

Laboratory GM Potency

Min 5.264

Max 17.474

Intra-laboratory %GCV

Min 3%

Max 103%

Sample B

Overall GM (IU/mL) 8.777

95% CL 6.395 - 12.045

Overall %GCV 56%

NIH Test Results – Samples A & B combined

Combined Overall GM Potencies for blinded duplicates of the Candidate 7th IS Rabies Vaccine (16/204) [Samples A and B] in NIH.

		LCL		UCL
Samples A and B N=20	Overall GM Potency (IU/mL)	7.208	8.790	10.722
	Overall %GCV		51%	
	Max		17.474	
	Min		5.264	

NIH Test Results – Sample RAV (5th IS)

Rabies vaccine potencies for 5th IS Rabies Vaccine (RAV) expressed relative to the 6th IS (8 IU/mL in 1 mL) in the NIH Test.

Lab Code *	Assay	LCL	Potency (IU/mL)	UCL	Intra-laboratory %GCV	LCL	Laboratory GM Potency (IU/mL)	UCL
2	1	4.155	8.822	18.886				
2	2	14.723	36.492	101.174	105%	9.474	16.187	27.656
2	3	6.705	21.350	78.096				
3a	1	9.200	21.822	54.569				
3a	2	2.608	7.726	22.689	87%	11.126	18.264	29.982
3a	3	11.663	23.720	48.776				
6a	1	8.147	32.449	152.439				
6a	2	7.860	24.004	85.065	38%	10.811	24.201	54.171
6a	3	3.687	16.965	99.305				
7a	1	4.243	7.989	14.964				
7a	2	4.762	9.026	17.484	12%	6.299	9.002	12.866
7a	3	5.632	9.945	18.009				

5th IS Rabies Vaccine (RAV)
assigned value
16 IU/mL

Very close to the assigned potency

Note*: Not all laboratories received RAV for testing.

		LCL		UCL
RAV N=4	Overall GM Potency (IU/mL)	8.216	15.931	30.890
	Overall %GCV		52%	

ELISA Results – Sample A (16/204)

Lab Code	Assay	LCL	Potency (IU/mL)	UCL	Intra-laboratory %GCV	LCL	Laboratory GM Potency (IU/mL)	UCL
3b	1	5.076	5.190	5.305				
3b	2	5.064	5.226	5.393	4.0%	5.079	5.166	5.256
3b	3	4.614	4.868	5.137				
4	1	5.323	5.535	5.754				
4	2	5.853	6.194	6.554	7.8%	5.343	5.647	5.969
4	3	5.255	5.369	5.486				
6b1	1	4.754	4.989	5.234				
6b1	2	4.881	5.056	5.238	12.0%	4.924	5.340	5.790
6b1	3	5.750	6.112	6.497				
6b2	1	5.077	5.188	5.302				
6b2	2	4.831	4.963	5.098	3.2%	5.032	5.156	5.284
6b2	3	5.202	5.276	5.352				
6b1 and 6b2 results on the same reconstituted material combined*					8.1%	5.056	5.209	5.366
7b	1	4.158	4.350	4.555				
7b	2	3.897	4.349	4.861	0.6%	4.210	4.333	4.459
7b	3	4.073	4.303	4.552				
9a**	1	~	invalid	~				
9a**	2	~	invalid	~	n/d	n/d	n/d	n/d
9a**	3	~	invalid	~				
12a	1	4.389	4.563	4.743				
12a	2	4.238	4.396	4.560	4.3%	4.320	4.426	4.535
12a	3	3.955	4.197	4.451				
15	1	5.368	5.644	5.932				
15	2	5.218	5.362	5.509	7.9%	4.978	5.257	5.552
15	3	4.734	4.864	4.996				
16	1	4.256	4.516	4.792				
16	2	3.808	3.962	4.122	25.2%	4.103	4.781	5.570
16	3	5.795	6.134	6.493				

Sample A	
Laboratory GM Potency	
Min	4.333
Max	5.647
Intra-laboratory %GCV	
Min	0.6%
Max	25.2%

Sample A	
Overall GM (IU/mL)	4.954
95% CL	4.528-5.421
Overall %GCV	10.2%

*For laboratory 6b, the combined operator results were used to determine overall GM and %GCV.

** Assays for laboratory 9a invalid due to confidence intervals for individual assay falling outside the 80%-120% range.

ELISA Results – Sample B (16/204)

Blinded Duplicate

Lab Code	Assay	LCL	Potency (IU/mL)	UCL	Intra-laboratory %GCV	LCL	Laboratory GM Potency (IU/mL)	UCL
3b	1	4.820	5.039	5.268	4.9%	4.973	5.170	5.374
3b	2	5.308	5.420	5.535				
3b	3	4.729	4.948	5.177				
4	1	5.236	5.463	5.700	4.6%	5.545	5.635	5.727
4	2	5.656	5.972	6.305				
4	3	5.528	5.631	5.735				
6b1	1	5.049	5.165	5.283	5.0%	5.041	5.256	5.481
6b1	2	5.291	5.544	5.810				
6b1	3	4.708	5.045	5.405				
6b2	1	5.132	5.216	5.302	2.9%	5.109	5.222	5.336
6b2	2	4.978	5.074	5.172				
6b2	3	5.279	5.373	5.468				
6b1 and 6b2 results on the same reconstituted material combined*					3.7%	5.144	5.229	5.316
7b	1	4.067	5.268	6.781	10.1%	4.283	4.400	4.520
7b	2	4.426	4.755	5.105				
7b	3	4.239	4.348	4.459				
9a**	1	~	invalid	~	n/d	n/d	n/d	n/d
9a**	2	~	invalid	~				
9a**	3	~	invalid	~				
12a	1	4.542	4.731	4.926	7.1%	4.355	4.586	4.830
12a	2	4.624	4.792	4.966				
12a	3	4.039	4.228	4.424				
15	1	5.111	5.370	5.639	5.1%	5.136	5.338	5.547
15	2	5.472	5.572	5.673				
15	3	4.891	5.049	5.211				
16	1	4.406	4.622	4.848	8.8%	3.965	4.222	4.496
16	2	3.732	3.914	4.104				
16	3	3.956	4.160	4.375				

Sample B	
Laboratory GM Potency	
Min	4.222
Max	5.635
Intra-laboratory %GCV	
Min	3.7%
Max	10.1%

Sample B	
Overall GM (IU/mL)	4.915
95% CL	4.441-5.439
Overall %GCV	11.6%

*For laboratory 6b, the combined operator results were used to determine overall GM and %GCV.

** Assays for laboratory 9a invalid due to confidence intervals for individual assay falling outside the 80%-120% range.

ELISA Results – Samples A & B combined

Combined Overall GM Potencies for blinded duplicates of the Candidate 7th IS Rabies Vaccine (16/204) [Samples A and B] in ELISA.

		LCL		UCL
Samples A and B N=14	overall GM Potency (IU/mL)	4.650	4.937	5.242
	Overall %GCV		10.5%	
	Max		5.647	
	Min		4.222	

SRD Results – Sample A (16/204)

Lab Code	Assay	LCL	Potency (IU/mL)	UCL	Intra-laboratory %GCV	LCL	Laboratory GM Potency (IU/mL)	UCL
1	1	5.794	6.164	6.550				
1	2	3.678	3.904	4.134	28.6%	4.395	5.212	6.181
1	3	5.442	5.895	6.368				
3c	1	4.269	5.251	5.315				
3c	1	0.000	4.786	6.076				
3c	2	5.245	6.113	6.721	n/a	5.223	5.715	6.254
3c	2					5.174	5.736	6.361
3c	3	~	Invalid*	~				
3c	3	3.282	4.610	5.271				
7c	1	5.056	5.559	6.077				
7c	2	4.576	5.069	5.561	4.9%	5.062	5.289	5.527
7c	3	4.684	5.212	5.744				
8	1	4.805	5.743	6.770				
8	2	5.527	6.763	8.309	8.5%	5.635	6.203	6.828
8	3	5.036	6.247	7.684				
13a	1	4.626	5.654	6.779				
13a	2	5.750	6.430	7.183	9.3%	5.562	5.970	6.408
13a	3	4.641	5.415	6.230				
13b	1	5.200	5.785	6.403				
13b	2	5.514	6.163	6.869	5.6%	5.555	5.918	6.305
13b	3	4.234	5.532	6.853				

Highlighted: post-public consultation corrections

*Invalid due to 95% CL falling outside 80%-120%

Sample A	
Laboratory GM Potency	
Min	5.212
Max	6.203
Intra-laboratory %GCV	
Min	4.9%
Max	28.6%

Sample A	
Overall GM (IU/mL)	5.706
	5.710
95% CL	5.3074-6.1440
Overall %GCV	7.2%

SRD Results – Sample B (16/204)

Lab Code	Assay	LCL	Potency (IU/mL)	UCL	Intra-laboratory %GCV	LCL	Laboratory GM Potency (IU/mL)	UCL
1	1	5.560	6.022	6.508				
1	2	6.453	6.739	7.052	8.1%	5.852	6.217	6.605
1	3	5.348	5.799	6.267				
3c	1	4.649	6.300	7.209				
3c	2	6.087	6.375	6.632	0.6%	6.172	6.349	6.532
3c	3	6.043	6.324	6.588				
7c	1	4.113	4.630	5.133				
7c	2	4.417	4.913	5.403	8.4%	4.783	5.011	5.250
7c	3	4.906	5.432	5.969				
8	1	5.312	6.346	7.549				
8	2	5.277	6.499	7.982	4.4%	5.709	6.267	6.879
8	3	4.959	5.981	7.133				
13a	1	4.598	5.640	6.781				
13a	2	5.093	5.894	6.768	5.6%	5.173	5.595	6.050
13a	3	4.563	5.292	6.050				
13b	1	5.305	6.188	7.182				
13b	2	4.843	6.150	7.707	6.8%	5.436	5.973	6.563
13b	3	4.399	5.506	6.625				

Blinded Duplicate

Sample B	
Laboratory GM Potency	
Min	5.011
Max	6.349
Intra-laboratory %GCV	
Min	0.6%
Max	8.4%

Sample B	
Overall GM (IU/mL)	5.882
95% CL	5.347-6.471
Overall %GCV	9.5%

SRD Results – Samples A & B combined

Combined Overall GM Potencies for blinded duplicates of the Candidate 7th IS Rabies Vaccine (16/204) [Samples A and B] in SRD.

		LCL		UCL
Samples A and B N=12	overall GM Potency (IU/mL)	5.510 5.490	5.794 5.773	6.091 6.071
	Overall %GCV		8.2%	
	Max		6.349	
	Min		5.011	

Highlighted: post-public consultation corrections

Stability of Candidate 7th IS (16/204)

Temperature (°C)	Combined Potency by ELISA n=3 (IU/mL)	95% CI	Predicted % Monthly Loss (UCL)	Predicted % Yearly Loss (UCL)
-20	97.92	0.93-1.03	0 (0)	0.002 (0.037)
+4	99.07	0.96-1.01	0.009 (0.094)	0.111 (1.164)
+20	99.05	0.97-1.01	0.087 (0.486)	1.042 (5.708)
+37	90.87	0.87-0.95	0.73 (1.634)	8.416 (17.93)

- The predicted loss of potency is 0.002% per year when stored at -20 °C
- The candidate 7th IS Rabies vaccine is stable for long-term storage at -20 °C
- Given that the predicated loss of potency at 37 °C is 0.73 % per month, the 7th IS may be shipped at ambient temperature.

Comments/Issues/Summary

- Ten participating laboratories responded to the report. There were no disagreements with the suitability of the candidate (NIBSC code 16/204) to serve as the 7th WHO IS for Rabies Vaccine.
- 16/204 should be assigned different unitages for the 3 assay methods.
- Some respondents had queries or suggestions for editorial changes and these have been addressed.
- One participant indicated that Huber's robust means should be calculated for the three assay methods to account for outliers. This has been added to the report.

Assay	NIH	ELISA	SRD
16/204 Overall GM Potency (IU/mL)	8.79	4.94	5.79
16/204 Overall %GCV	51%	10.5%	8.2%
95% Confidence Interval	7.21-10.72	4.65-5.24	5.51-6.09
16/204 Huber's Robust Mean (IU/mL)	8.86	4.89	5.84

Accepted Proposal

Table 25. Proposed unitage (IU/ampoule) and recommended volumes for reconstitution of the candidate 7th IS (16/204) for use in the NIH test, ELISA or SRD assay. The unitage is derived from the Huber's robust mean for each assay method.

Assay	NIH	ELISA	SRD
Proposed unitage	8.9 IU/ampoule	2.5 IU/ampoule	2.9 IU/ampoule
Recommended volume for reconstitution	1 mL	0.5 mL	0.5mL

Participants

Name	Laboratory	Country
Alejandro Parola, Analía De Nichilo	Fundación Pablo Cassará, (Pablo Cassara Foundation)	Argentina
Maria Luisa Brero, Silvina Gil, Javier Espeche, Silvana Deluchi, Carlos Atzori	Servicio Vacunas Bacterianas Centro Nacional de Control de Calidad de Biológicos (CNCCB) Administración Nacional de Laboratorios e Institutos de Salud. (ANLIS) “Dr Carlos G Malbrán”	Argentina
Cynthia M. Allen, Gayle Pulle	Viral Vaccines Division, Center for Biologics Evaluation (CBE) Biologics and Genetic Therapies Directorate (BGTD), Health Canada	Canada
Stéphane MAISONNEUVE	Agence Nationale de Sécurité du Médicament et des produits de santé (ANSM)	France
Marie-Paule Furnion, Delphine Painblanc; Nicolas Bardy, Audrey Toinon	SANOFI PASTEUR	France
Kristina Scheerer, Andre Noll, Heidi Scholz	GSK Vaccines GmbH	Germany
Beate Krämer, Constanze Göpfert	Paul-Ehrlich-Institut (PEI), Federal Institute for Vaccines and Biomedicines	Germany
Sai D. Prasad, Dipankar Das, Gopal Singh	Bharat Biotech International Limited, Hyderabad	India
Sunil Gairola	Serum Institute of India Pvt. Ltd.	India
Guillermo Vega Rodriguez	Commission for Analytical Control and Coverage Extension (CCAYAC) COFEPRIS	Mexico
Nadezhda Alekseeva	Krasnoyarsk branch of the Federal State Budgetary Institution ‘Information and Methodological Centre for Expertise, Stocktaking and Analysis of Circulation of Medical Products’ of the Federal Service on Surveillance in Healthcare	Russian Federation
Srđan Stankov, Dusan Lalosevic	Department for Microbiology, Pasteur Institute Novi Sad	Serbia
Derek Litthauer, Yolandi Roodt, Quinton Meyer	National Control Laboratory of South Africa University of the Free State	South Africa
Supaporn Phumiamorn, Koraphong Pinyosukhee	Institute of Biological Products, Department of Medical Sciences Ministry of Public Health	Thailand
Judith Prince	National Institute for Biological Standardisation (NIBSC)	UK
Alethea Fry	Center for Veterinary Biologics, Virology, Policy, Evaluation, and Licensing USDA/APHIS/VS/CVB	USA